

ORDER SHEET  
IN THE HIGH COURT OF SINDH AT KARACHI

ITRA 294 of 2019

DATE	ORDER WITH SIGNATURE OF JUDGE(S)
------	----------------------------------

1. For orders on office objection No.24.
2. For hearing of main case.

**23.10.2025**

Mr. Nadir Hussain, advocate holding brief for Mr. Irfan Mir Halepota, advocate for the applicant.

Courier tracking report is placed on record. Reference application is pending since 2019 and the respondent has chosen to remain absent. On the last date notice was directed to be repeated and courier tracking report demonstrating service has been placed on record.

Per learned counsel the impugned order is devoid of any independent deliberation and / or reasoning and cannot be considered as a speaking order. Per learned counsel the same is not befitting the last fact-finding forum in the statutory hierarchy.

The Appellate Tribunal is the last fact finding forum in the statutory hierarchy, therefore, it is incumbent to render independent deliberations and findings on each issue. The manner in which the appeals in general are to be addressed has been emphasized by the Supreme Court in the judgment reported as 2019 SCMR 1626. This High Court has consistently maintained that the Appellate Tribunal is required to proffer independent reasons and findings, and in the absence thereof a perfunctory order could not be sustained. Reliance is placed on the judgment dated 02.10.2024 in SCRA 1113 of 2023 and judgment dated 27.08.2024 in SCRA 757 of 2015. Earlier Division Bench judgments have also maintained that if the impugned order is discrepant in the manner as aforesaid, the correct course is to remand the matter for adjudication afresh. Reliance is placed on the judgment dated 10.12.2024 in ITRA 343 of 2024.

We are of the considered view that the impugned judgment could not be considered to be a speaking order and is *prima facie* devoid of relevant discussion and deliberation. The entire judgment is comprised of reproduction and crowned with a dissonant conclusion. Therefore, no case is set forth to sustain the impugned judgment and the same is hereby set

*aside*; the matter is remanded back to the Appellate Tribunal for adjudication afresh per the law.

A copy of this decision may be sent under the seal of this Court and the signature of the Registrar to the learned Appellate Tribunal, as required per section 133(8) of the Income Tax Ordinance, 2001. Office is instructed to place copy hereof in the connected files.

Judge

Judge