ORDER SHEET HIGH COURT OF SINDH AT KARACHI

C.P.No.D-5620 of 2019

DATE ORDER WITH SIGNATURE(S) OF JUDGE(S)

For hearing of main case.

20-12-2019

Mr.Tariq Mansoor, Advocate/Petitioner in person.

Mr.Jawad Dero, Additional Advocate General.

Ms.Azra Muqeem, Law Officer, K.M.C.

Mr.Ghulam Mohiuddin, Assistant Attorney General.

Mr.Nisar Ahmed Memon, Additional Secretary, Health Department, Government of Sindh is present.

Mr.Khalil-ur-Rehman, Section Officer (Legal), Local Government, Government of Sindh.

Dr.Altaf Hussain Shaikh, Chief Technical Officer & Focal Person Litigation, Health Department.

Mr.Barkatullah Memon, Municipal Commissioner, DMC South is present.

Mr.Rafique Shaikh, Municipal Commissioner, DMC Korangi Karachi.

Mr.Safdar Ali Bughio, Municipal Commissioner, DMC Malir, Karachi.

Mr.Ashfaq Mullah, Municipal Commissioner, DMC East, Karachi.

Mr.Muhammad Faheem Khan, Municipal Commissioner, DMC Karachi Central.

Mr.Mirza Saleem Akhtar, Advocate for DMC South Karachi Ms.Saima, Advocate for DMC East.

Mr.Ahmed Zamir, Advocate for DMC West Karachi

Mr.Sarwar Ali, Advocate for DMC Korangi Karachi

Mr.Shoukat Ali Shaikh, Advocate for DMC Malir Karachi

Mr.Abdul Khalil, Advocate for DMC Central Karachi

Mr.Afzal Saeed Khan, Law Officer, DMC Central Karachi.

Mr.M.Asif Malik, Advocate for Cantonment Board Malir.

Mr.Ashraf Ali Butt & Ms.Rehmatunisa, Advocates for Cantonment Board Clifton, Faisal and Korangi.

Mr.Muhammad Aslam, Advocate for Karachi Cantonment Board.

Mr.Muhammad Fahad Pirzada, Advocate for Cantonment Board Manora.

Mr.Naseem-ul-Haq, Legal Assistant, Cantonment Board, Hyderabad is present.

Mr.Tanveer-ul-Haq, Office Superintendent, Cantonment Board Pano Aqil is present.

Ms.Momal holding brief for Mr.Rafique Ahmed, Advocate for Cantonment Board Pano Aqil and Cantonment Board Hyderabad.

• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •

Mr.Muhammad Fahad Pirzada, Advocate has filed Vakalatnama for Cantonment Board Manora and Ms. Momal holding brief for Mr.Rafique Ahmed, Advocate has filed Vakalatnamas for Cantonment Board Pano Aqil and Hyderabad. Learned counsel are directed to submit their reports with regard to their efforts against stray/street dogs in their territorial limits i.e. Cantonment Board Hyderabad and Pano Aqil. Learned counsel for the petitioner is directed to supply copy of petition to the learned Advocates for Cantonment Board Manora, Hyderabad and Pano Aqil during the course of the day.

Mr.Naseem-ul-Haq, Legal Assistant, Cantonment Board, Hyderabad and Mr.Tanveer-ul-Haq, Office Superintendent, Cantonment Board Pano Aqil submit that they are making all best efforts in their territorial limits to safe the general public from dog biting incidents and they request for time to submit their reply.

Learned counsel for Cantonment Board Clifton, Faisal and Korangi has submitted further progress report. In the report of Clifton Cantonment Board it is stated that CBC Sanitation Branch in collaboration with Indus Hospital Karachi has launched a program in the CBC limits, where they have trained CBC Dog Catcher/Shooters to catch and vaccinate them. Similarly, a well equipped container with latest operation theaters facilities have been placed in Phase-VI, DHA Karachi where stray dogs are brought vaccinated and sterilized surgically and they are hopeful that they will able to vaccinate and / or sterilize most of the stray dogs of the CBC area. They are directed to continue their campaign in compliance of the last order.

Mr.Khalil-ur-Rehman, Section Officer (Legal), Local Government, Government of Sindh has submitted the progress report in which it is stated that the PC-1 i.e. Fight Against Rabies & Checking Population of Stray Dogs Programme Sindh at the cost of Rs.1074.703 million has been forwarded to the Chairperson, Planning and Development Board on 18.12.2019 for its approval. Earlier also we had given directions to expedite approval of PC-1 but only reply has been submitted that the matter is forwarded for approval of Chairperson, Planning & Development Board. No time has been mentioned in the progress report when the approval will be made by the Planning and Development Department and we noted that even the PC-1 was forwarded on 18.12.2019, which shows that the matter is being delayed without any justification despite the fact that larger public interest is involved and the Government functionaries should take it seriously to resolve the issue.

Various dog bite incidents have occurred in Province of Sindh. Progress reports are being submitted by DMCs and Cantonment Boards, but the Local Government Department is still at approval stage of the programme, which is to be launched with the nomenclature "Fight Against Rabies & Checking Population of Stray Dogs Programme Sindh". Such matter cannot be left unattended for an unlimited period of time rather than the Government functionaries should have made all best possible efforts to save the public at large who are facing threats and harassment in their respective areas and various incidents have also reported in the print and electronic media in which people have lost their lives.

As a last chance, we allow 20 days' time to the Secretary, Local Government Department, Government Sindh and the Chairperson, Planning & Development Board to consider the PC-1 and after its due approval forward the same with summary to the worthy Chief Minister Sindh, so that further action may be taken at their end for the approval of scheme and immediately after approval, the programme should be launched in Sindh and for general awareness, the public messages should be released in print and electronic media. We also expect that while launching programme some complaint cell and helpline for registering complaints for general public be made so that action should be taken by the staff deployed to perform their services in the aforesaid programme.

Mr.Nisar Ahmed Memon, Additional Secretary, Health Department, Government of Sindh has submitted compliance report to show the inventory of Anti Rabies Vaccine (ARV) available in different Hospital/dispensaries i.e. Hyderabad, Matiari, Dadu, T.M.Khan, Sujawal, Badin, Thatta, Jamshoro, Tando Allahyar, Mirpurkhas, Tharparkar, Umerkot, Shaheed Benazirabad, Naushahro Feroaze, Sanghar, Sukkur, Ghotiki, Khairpur, Larkana, Kamber, Kashmore, Shikarpur, Jacobabad, Karachi Korangi, Karachi East, Karachi Central, Karachi Malir, Karachi West and Karachi South. They have mentioned total number of 287 hospitals/dispensaries with available inventory of 11903 ARV. Though according to this report they are maintaining appropriate inventory to meet exigency/emergency to tackle dog bite incidents, but recently one child namely Husnain who suffered dog biting incident at Larkana was shifted to NICH Karachi in serious condition. Learned counsel for the petitioner submits that he expired on 11.12.2019. He further argued that according to print and electronic media Husnain was not provided vaccine at Larkana and in same emergent condition he was shifted a NICH, Karachi when his case was deteriorated and ultimately he died. Mr.Nisar Ahmed Memon, Additional Secretary, Health Department, Government of Sindh is directed to inquire Medical Superintendent, Chandka Medical College & Hospital, Larkana and he will also collect some information from NICH, Karachi as to whether this child was vaccinated for dog biting at hospital or not. He is further directed to maintain proper inventory of ARV in Government Hospitals/Dispensaries in Sindh.

Ms.Azra Muqeem, Law Officer, K.M.C. reiterated that they have 04 hospitals i.e Abbasi Shaheed Hospital, Sarfraz Rafiqui Shaheed Hospital, Gazdarabad Hospital, Ramswami, Karachi and Landhi Medical Complex KMC, where they are maintaining the inventory of ARV properly. Municipal Commissioner, K.M.C. is directed to maintain the inventory of ARV in all K.M.C. Hospitals.

Learned counsel for DMC South, West, Central, East, Malir and Korangi undertake to file further progress report that their campaign against stray/street dogs is continuing. They are once again directed to continue their campaigns in larger public interest with full dedication.

When we asked learned AAG with regard to performance of task force, he submits that the task force has been constituted in pursuance of orders passed by this court. Learned counsel for DMCs submits that their campaign is continuing, they are facing some problems of but non-availability of poison. The purpose of task force is to handle the day to day issues being faced by the different DMCs and Cantonment Boards. Learned AAG submits that the Special Secretary, Local Government Department is Chairperson of the Task Force. All the DMCs and Cantonment Boards are directed to communicate their problems in writing to the Task Force, which will be resolved immediately after receiving the complaint by the Task Force on urgent basis. Learned AAG shall submit progress report with regard to approval of PC-1 on the next date. By consent adjourned to 14.01.2020 at 11:00 a.m.

Judge

Judge

ns