



2. Additional Secretary Education further submits that despite direction, Director Schools have failed to submit reports/proposal regarding SNE(s). Such letters are attached with report. The manner wherein the Director (s) schools, *prima facie*, responded to **Secretary Education** is not only surprising but amounts to delaying compliance of directives of this Court which, needless to add, has its legal consequences. Accordingly, issue notices to Director (s) Schools in all Divisional ranges for personal appearance with direction to submit proposal/revised SNE including fresh as well their explanation for their failure, as complained by the Additional Secretary Education.

3. Secretary Finance Department submitted compliance report with regard to SNEs and posts created in last ten years, however, that report is not categorical. The Education Department has got *vast* field hence without categorization, the quarter (s) concerned cannot be expected to move for achieving the ultimate goal i.e. **filling up sanctioned post (s)**, hence, Secretary Finance shall submit complete breakup of ten years by showing number of SNEs with names of institutions and date, month and year of approval. The report submitted reflects that out of sanctioned posts of **2,63,894/-** around **100,000** posts are lying vacant in School Education Department, whereas out of **22,817** sanctioned post around **8000** posts are vacant in College Education Department. The number of vacant post (s) *itself* speaks volume of how much appreciation is being given to **education** sector which, otherwise, is claimed to be kept at **priority**. Placement of things in some order *only* is never of much significance but planning (s) and positive step (s) could only show intention(s). Accordingly, Secretary Schools and Secretary

Colleges shall ensure that all steps are taken to fill all those vacancies and report shall be submitted before this Court.

4. At this juncture, he contends that Education Department has communicated order dated 12.10.2020 to the Secretary (I&C), SGA&CD and draft rules are pending for further process however, same are yet not finalized. Office shall communicate order dated 12.10.2020 to the Secretary, (I&C), SGA&CD who shall ensure compliance of order, particular paragraph No.3 by removing the possibility of strangers/aliens to be posted in Education Department.

5. Secretary Colleges and Secretary Board and Universities shall appear in person and submit compliance report regarding duration of 16 years BSc and B.A. in degree colleges.

6. At this juncture Chairman, Education Committee, (as notified) submits report with regard to Technical Education and School Education; taken on record; relevant recommendations are reproduced herewith:-

**Extract from Report of steering committee on Revamping TVET Sector in Sindh:**

**3. Recommendations & Action Plan**

Based on the current situation, issues & challenges and initiatives / progress of the Sindh TEVTA and overall TVET Sector in Sindh, following recommendations are proposed in order to bring TVET at par with national and gradually international level. Surely, these recommendations will be enabling provincial government in reforming TVET sector for greater employability youth and industrial growth.

**3.1 Governance:**

TVET Sector is the only solution for poverty alleviation, greater employability and growth in Sindh. Therefore as first step TVET warrants governance reforms on war-footing basis as below:

**a) Roles and Responsibilities of different TVET bodies in Sindh.**

- 1] STEVTA is an autonomous body. However, STEVTA has no control on the transfer, posting, promotions and appointment of BS-17 and above staff (Civil and Public Servants). Which hinders in getting best performance of its staff. Appropriate amendments in STEVTA Rules / Regulations shall be made to make STEVTA autonomous in performing its functions.
- 2) TTB shall be merged with SBTE and given under the administrative control of STEVTA through its Managing Director as in Punjab.
- 3) The composition of SBTE Board is cumbersome and does not include relevant stakeholders, which results in low recognition of SBTE certificate, transparency and quality issues of assessment & certification of SBTE. The board shall be restricted and have only seven members i.e. two nominees of STEVTA (nominated by MD), one rep. of NAVTIC, three rep. from engineering & technology universities each from BBSUTSD, MUET and NED and one Chairman SBTE.
- 4) For best collaboration with private sector and industry, modern apprenticeship shall be implemented on the pattern of Federal Government for shared funding-governance model. In order to implement mandatory apprenticeship in Sindh, Industry and Labour Department, GoS shall be made bound to seek NOC from STEVTA for renewal and issuance of certificate of registration to industries.
- 5) All non-functional institutes shall be operated under Public-Private-Partnership in accordance with applicable rules / policy of Authority.

**Action & Responsibility:** Honorable High Court of Sindh may like to issue directions to Sindh Government (Law, SGA&CD, Industries & Labour Departments) for making appropriate amendments in respective laws of these bodies in light of this report in collaboration with Sindh TEVTA.

**b) HR/Management:**

- 1) Three-year tenure security / posting of present Managing Director shall be ensured in accordance with STEVTA Act so that he could continue the reform agenda in accordance with this report. It is worth to mention that while I was Secretary Education, Mr. Agha Sohail Ahmed proved his excellence in implementing reform agenda in Sindh Textbook Board, which was dead organization and in same state of affairs like STEVTA. He brought STB into a very good position. He is focused and man of action. He knows national and

international best practices of transforming public sector organizations on modern practices. Moreover, he has remained on senior positions like Chairman Sindh Textbook Board, DC Jamshoro and a graduate of London School of Economics. His continuity atleast for three years, in the position of Managing Director would definitely enable him to translate the proposed reforms agenda under this report into action.

2] On urgent basis teaching faculty and managerial staff shall be hired through competitive selection process / well reputed 3rd party recruitment agency in accordance with STEVTA Rules.

3] Posting and promotion of competent staff strictly on the basis of overall performance & competency reviewed by a high powered interview panel.

4) Discourage irrelevant posting / posting of teachers on administrative posts and posting / promotion of staff from one stream to another.

5] Unionization of employees has seriously damaged STEVTA. Ban on unionization of employees shall be imposed for next ten years to shift the focus of employees from non-productive activities to developmental / academic activities to make STEVTA a competitive and progressive organization.

**Action & Responsibility:** Sindh Government may be issued direction of ensuring three years' posting-tenure of present incumbent as Managing Director and Sindh TEVTA to strictly implement above recommendations.

**c) Monitoring and Evaluation:**

1) Implement Digital M&E System in all institutes, offices (budgeting, HR, assets, training management modules).

2) Constitute committees to regularly conduct field visits / monitoring. Managing Director himself shall carry out monitoring visits in each division at-least twice a month.

3) Regularly conduct tracer studies of TVET graduates and evaluate / align STEVTA Training programs according to the outcome of those studies / industrial needs.

4) Regulate mandatory registration and quality assurance mechanism of private training institutes in Sindh

5) STEVTA Senior Management including faculty shall carryout nation-wide study visits and visits of those countries that have a robust TVET system so that the same shall be adapted / implemented in Sindh.

**Action & Responsibility:** Sindh TEVTA shall develop and implement effective systems in light of above recommendations.

### **3.2 Infrastructure**

Since establishment of STEVTA, no allocations of funds under for maintenance & repair, purchase of furniture & fixture, machinery & equipment, library and transport are made by Government. However, STEVTA from time to time has procured / provided some basic furniture, machinery, IT equipment and transport out of its single-line-grant. Yet, a huge investment is needed to make TVET institutes upto the mark and in line with other provinces and international best practices. Following improvements are essentially required for provision of quality training to youth of Sindh:

#### **a) Building and Infrastructure:**

- 1) Fifty percent of STEVTA buildings require essential renovation and repair work (several are in collapsible condition). Every year atleast 500 Million budget shall be embarked for annual M&R of Buildings.
- 2) Several Institutes are operating within the premises of other institutes and other are operating in overlapping within the vicinity of 5-10 KM. These institutes shall either be merged or declared as campus of main institute by offering new demand driven & modern innovative training programs.
- 3) All new institutes shall be established on modern lines after conducting detailed feasibility study, TNA, geographic and industrial needs. The infrastructure / layout of new institutes shall be compact / multi-story style which should be easily manageable and shall operate in multi-shifts instead of huge infrastructures.
- 4) Adequate and durable furniture shall be provided / made available in each institute to accommodate atleast approved capacity of trainees.

**Action & Responsibility:** Finance Department, GoS and Sindh TEVTA shall be issued directions to implement year-wise plan in true letter & spirit and annual grant of PKR 500 Million for M&R of Buildings and PKR 25 Million for Furniture & Fixture.

#### **b) Lab/Workshop Equipment:**

- 1) Modern practices i.e. reliance on own equipment & machinery should be discouraged. All institutes shall be linked with relevant industry in the vicinity through modern apprenticeship schemes where trainees could perform practical work / OJT.
- 2) Where no industry is available, SmartLab and Smart Classroom concept shall be introduced. Limited number i.e. 1/4 of normal number of equipment may be procured / provided through provincial funding or donor funding.

**Action & Responsibility:** Sindh TEVTA shall prepare trade/ technology-wise list of equipment, identify relevant industry, yearly phase-wise rollout plan for linking TVET institutes with industry within five years. STEVTA to ensure availability of Smart Lab facilities to remaining institutes. Finance Department, GoS shall provide atleast annual 200 Million grants for procurement of Smart Lab and equipment & machinery in phase-wise manner for next five years.

**c) Libraries:**

1. E-Library facility on the pattern of Universities shall be established in collaboration with HEC in all institutes where Diploma of Associate Engineering & BS Tech Programs are offered.
2. Institute offering NVQF Level-5 and above qualifications shall be equipped with sufficient number of relevant textbooks, TLM and research journals.
3. Atleast five computer stations with internet connectivity shall be provided in each library.

**Action & Responsibility:** Finance Department, GoS to provide one time PKR 100 Million to Sindh TEVTA for provision of above facilities. STEVTA and HEC shall ensure establishment of Digital / E-Library facility in all institutes offering NVQF Level-5 and above training programs.

**d) Transport.**

Transport facility for female trainees in far-flung areas shall be provided on cost-sharing basis to meet its operational costs (50% trainee and 50% institute].

**Action & Responsibility:** STEVTA to ensure provision of transport facility to female institutes in far-flung areas.

**3.3 Quality Training:**

**1) New and Innovative Training Programs:**

- 1) Within three years STEVTA shall convert / shift all its existing training programs into modern national CBT System on the pattern of Punjab and KP TEVTA.
- 2) Modern and innovative training programs shall be introduced atleast in each district initially, and outdated training programs shall be replaced with modern and innovative training programs.
- 3) Education Department in collaboration with Sindh TEVTA shall introduce Matric-Tech as third stream of education for greater employability of youth and image building of TVET sector on the patter of Federal and KP governments.

4) Relevant equipment & machinery, TLM, staff and other essential infrastructure shall be provided by STEVTA in each district for provision of quality training on national standards.

5) The quality of examination & certification by SBTE and TTB is highly questionable and poor. It shall be improved and brought at the level of international repute. Necessary steps in collaboration with STEVTA, SBTE and TTB shall be taken within one year for restructuring SBTE, so that quality of skilled youth be ensured.

6) Establish production-cum-training facilities & introduce local handicraft trades like pottery, wood-work, Bengal making, Ajrak & Rilli making etc.

**Action & Responsibility:** STEVTA shall in each year rollout and convert 33% of its training programs into modern CBT and ensure sufficient allocation of funds / provision of necessary facilities for smooth transition along-with introduction of new training programs.

## **2) Training of Trainers and Staff Capacity Building.**

1) Staff Training Academy at Karachi, Hyderabad and Sukkur shall be urgently established and necessary staff, equipment & machinery, furniture & fixture etc. shall be provided for mandatory training & capacity building of all STEVTA employees.

2) No staff member (including civil servants and public servants) shall be promoted until they get mandatory training from STEVTA Staff Training Academy. Any employee not qualifying the training shall be considered as unfit for promotion.

3) Develop KPIs for measurement of performance of faculty, principals and other staff and those KPIs shall be linked with career progression of them.

**Action & Responsibility:** STEVTA to establish Staff Training Academies and provide necessary support for operationalization of them into existing institutes. Moreover; STEVTA shall strictly implement above recommendations to ensure competitive and progressive environment in its institutes / offices.

## **4) Modern Apprenticeships and on-job-training (OJT)**

1] Modern apprenticeships in light of the national apprenticeship model shall be introduced and implemented in all industries covered under the law. Industries and Labour Departments, Gos shall be bound to get NOC from Sindh TEVTA so that apprenticeship training industry could be enforced.



- 2) STEVTA institutes operating in industrial clusters shall be converted into apprenticeship training institutes in phase-wise manner in next 3 years.
- 3) Make On-Job-Training mandatory for atleast 1/3 duration of training in nearby industries/enterprises for greater employability of youth.
- 4) Introduce mandatory licensing & registration of skilled workers in across Sindh for ensuring quality assurance mechanism.

**Action & Responsibility:** STEVTA shall take up the apprenticeship legislative matter with law department for reforming the existing apprenticeship trainings into the model of federal government and make necessary amendments in rules / regulations for implementing above recommendations. Sindh Government shall issue directions to Industries and Labour Department for ensuring proper implementation of apprenticeship training in industries across Sindh.

#### **5) Job Placement Centers (JPC)**

- 1) Job Placement Centers (PCs) atleast in each district particularly in industrial clusters shall be established and operationalized.
- 2) All JPCs shall be linked with national job portal for greater employability of youth in national and overseas job markets.
- 3) JPCs shall facilitate skilled youth in job hunting and employers in provision of skilled youth in the local vicinity.
- 4] STEVTA shall conduct job fairs, career counseling and vocational guidance session on periodical basis through its JPCs in the area of operations of these centers.

**Action & Responsibility:** STEVTA shall implement above recommendations in next two years atleast in each district.

#### **3.4 Funding.**

##### **1) Non-lapsable single-line grant and shifting of operational budgets:**

- 1) Existing Single-line grant of STEVTA shall be shifted and disbursed by Finance Department, GoS through a non-lapsable account on annual basis in accordance with STEVTA Act to make authority financially autonomous. So that smooth financial business could be performed by

STEVTA on the pattern of other autonomous bodies to avoid mal-practice/ inordinate delays caused by Treasury / AG Office.

- 2] Presently, operational budgets are allocated to STEVTA Institutes under DDO-wise / cost-center allocations. Excluding employee related allocations, all operational budget allocations shall be transferred to STEVTA as single-line grant. So that STEVTA through its Board of Governors could make appropriate allocations based on actual demand/ utilization by institutes by ensuring greater transparency and effective use of funds.
- 3] All vacant positions reserved under direct recruitment quota shall be shifted to STEVTA from all cost-centers as per previous practice by Finance Department, GoS so that they could be filled in accordance with STEVTA Rules.
- 4] Allocate annual M&R budget for STEVTA Institutes.
- 5) Finance and Planning Departments Government of Sindh shall complete all projects executed by them in totality i.e. Building, Infrastructure, Equipment & Machinery and Creation of Positions of the institute / office (Capital, Revenue and SNE) before handing over of the same to STEVTA.

**Action & Responsibility:** Finance Department, GoS may be directed to approve above funding mechanism as in practice in vogue in different authorities / autonomous bodies and allocate additional funds of PKR 825 million per annum to implement above and serial No. 3.2(a), 3.2(b) and 3.2(c) recommendations in true letter and spirit.

#### **5) Public Private Partnership.**

Operationalize all non-functional institutes of STEVTA under public-private-partnerships in accordance with applicable policies/ laws.

**Action & Responsibility:** STEVTA to prepare PPP Policy / regulation and operationalize its existing non-functional institutes under PPP model. Finance Department, GoS to facilitate establishment of PPP Node and other required facilities for operationalization of PPP Unit in STEVTA."

As well relevant extract from Interim report dated 20.11.2020 is as under:-

#### **"Sub-Committee-XI: Libraries headed by Mr. Sarosh Hashmat Lodhi, VC, NED, University:**

41. The importance of public libraries can be judged because, in the UNESCO declaration, they considered potential sources for lifelong learning, independent

decision-making and cultural development for individuals and social groups. The public library provides access to various resources such as computers and the Internet, programs for children and adults, including consumer research, medical and financial information.

42. As a community center, public libraries offer equal opportunities to build a democratic and peaceful society, preserve knowledge and protect the national cultural heritage. In an era of fierce global competition in education, healthcare, business and technology, a library network suitable for the public is crucial to ensure equal public rights to information and to enable them to participate in state affairs. Based on these considerations, the results of this work give us the opportunity to understand the different perspectives on the state of Sindh public libraries. The government has been lagging behind since its inception to expand the network of public libraries across the province and that the process is still extremely slow. Even in many densely populated districts, there is only one public library, and in many regions, there are no public libraries yet. In the absence of government cooperation to expand and formulate effective plans, it will take time to expand the library network at the level of the Union Council. Inaccessible libraries, poor transportation, lack of digital literacy and technology (the Internet) began to negatively affect daily visitors and regular library members in each district. Besides, HEC has provided access to nine subscribed database resources, and these databases are underused due to a lack of user training in information and database resources. In addition, the nonprofessional administrators involved in decision making in public libraries were found to be a potential obstacle to the development and expansion of the libraries network.

43. The most effective form of library services is digital collections, which combine all the benefits of digital access with high-quality traditional content. In terms of implications, the future library may attract people's attention with its vibrant cultural activities, rich resources, network facilities, well-trained staffing services, and an expanding village-level network to maintain people's reading habits. Reforms in the services of public libraries and the creation of networks, including for their attendants, recommended to the government on the basis of literary arguments and research results, can lead to qualitative reforms in libraries if they are carried out with true spirit.

**Directions of Honourable High Court of Sindh issued in other Constitutional Petitions:**

44. It may be added that the Chairman of the Education Committee has also discussed very apt, pertinent and practical directions / observations of Honourable High Court of Sindh

issued during hearings in the instant suit and other related CPs with all stake holders and committee members to make part of the policy at relevant places so as have a comprehensive policy may be placed in the field in the quality education in the province. Some of the directions are regarding the following matters:

- **Accreditation Council/ Board** (CPD-1817 of 2016 orders dated 23.8.2017, 29.8.2017 02.8.2019, Suit No. 1243 of 2015 order dated 28.1.2020)
- **Establishment of Science and IT Labs** (CPD-1817 of 2016 order dated 23.8.2017)
- **Mobility of officers on the administrative posts** (CPD-1817 of 2016 order dated 23.8.2017)
- **Completion of School Buildings and SNEs** (CPD-1817 of 2016 order dated 29.8.2017)
- **Rationalization of need. Higher secondary Schools** (CPD-1817 of 2016 order dated 29.8.2017 20.9.2017 and 02.8.2019)
- **Biometric System in Colleges** (CPD-1817 of 2016 order dated 29.8.2017 and 02.8.2019)
- **Colleges and universities at district and divisional** (CPD-1817 of 2016/ 20.9.2017 2nd Appeal No. 32 of 2016)
- **Establishment of digital and manual libraries** (CPD-1817 of 2016/ 02.8.2019 2nd Appeal No. 32 of 2016 07.3.2020; Suit No. 1243 of 2015 order dated 28.1.2020)
- **Phasing out of BA/B.Sc two years programs replacing it with Associate Degree Programs** (CPD-1817 of 2016 order dated 02.8.2019 and 11.12.2019; Suit No. 1243 of 2015 order dated 28.1.2020 and 20.3.2020)
- **Post of Carrier Counselors they shall be appointed on divisional level** (Suit No. 1243 of 2015 order dated 28.1.2020)
- **Proper and timely utilized by the Departments** (Suit No. 1243 of 2015 order dated 10.6.2020)

**Finalization of the Education Policy:**

45. The finalization of Education Policy will be done after Review committees' endorsement of sub-sector plans, and thereafter would be presented in the Core Committee. That after the consolidation and the review, the drafts of the sub-committees will be presented before the Educations Reforms Committee for discussions and critical analyses through a systematic approach, to propose a viable policy covering persistent implementation strategy, Internal controls and institutional accountability. After, the overall examination,

analysis of the policy recommendations will further be reviewed by the Core Committee, Heads of Sub-Committees and the Review Committee to give it a formal shape in order to place it before the Education Reforms Committee for final approval and subsequent submission before the Honourable Court.

46. The highest challenge of Education reforms in the province will be its implementation. The problem is not what needs to be done, but **how will these aims/goals be achieved.**

SD/-

DR. IQ BAL HUSSAIN DURRANI

Ex- Secretary Education/ Ex-Federal Secretary  
Chairman Education Reforms Committee”

Dated 20.11.2020. “

The referred report, I do acknowledge, shows the labour but paragraph No.46 to the extent “*The problem is not what needs to be done, **but how will these aims / goals be achieved***” needs to be responded. The *identification* of things to be done has *already* been made but the problem was / is always ‘**how will these aims / goals be achieved**’. For this purpose, *alone*, the ‘**Committee**’ is constituted. The committee, within four corners, shall always be competent to ensure turning the question ‘**how will these aims / goals be achieved**’ into ‘**by these action (s) (procedures) the specified aims / goals shall stand achieved**’. Accordingly, Secretary Schools, Secretary Colleges, Secretary Boards and Universities, Secretaries of SGA&CD, Secretary Finance and Managing Director, STEVTA, shall cooperate with Chairman of the Education Committee (DR. IQBAL HUSSAIN DURRANI) which (cooperation) includes **meetings** and they all, including Chairman, shall ensure that final report is submitted preferably within one month and be present on next date of hearing so as to say **by these action (s) (procedures) the specified aims / goals shall stand achieved.**

7. Report submitted on behalf of Technical Education Department is taken on record. Learned counsel for plaintiff No.2 receives draft rules and seeks time to examine the same and file objection if any. They would be at liberty to file the same.

To come up on 11.01.2021 at 11.30 a.m. Office shall communicate this order to all concerned quarters.

**J U D G E**

IK